



STEERING COMMITTEE MEETING

MINUTES (Via Teams)

20 October 2023 at 10:00 am

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
1.0 OPENING – RECORD OF ATTENDANCE	3
2.0 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS (Financial / Impartiality / Proximity)	3
3.0 CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES OF MEETING – 01 SEPTEMBER 2023	3
4.0 FLYING MINUTE - Shire of Merredin – Program Gap	4
5.0 SHIRE OF DUMBLEYUNG RESEAL REQUEST	6
6.0 SHIRE OF WONGAN-BALLIDU 2023/2024 PROJECT	8
7.0 S45R BITUMEN BINDER	10
8.0 SHIRE OF CUBALLING – REQUEST FOR BUDGET INCREASE	12
9.0 SHIRE OF MERREDIN CULVERT 9.18 MERREDIN-NAREMBEEN ROAD	14

1.0 OPENING – RECORD OF ATTENDANCE

The Chairperson of the Steering Committee opened the meeting at 10:03am and read the record of attendance.

1.1 Present

Cr Wayne Gibson	Chairperson – Voting Member	SRRG - Moora
Cr Rosemary Madacsi	Voting Member	SRRG - Avon
Cr Darrel Hudson	Voting Member	SRRG – Kellerberrin
Cr Eileen O’Connell	Voting Member	SRRG – Northeast
Cr Trevor Stacey	Voting Member	SRRG - Roe
John Nuttall	Program Director	WSFN
Peter Hall	Program Manager	WSFN
Racelis Rose	Executive Officer	WSFN
Mohammad Siddiqui	Non-Voting Member	Main Roads WA Representative
Jacqui Early	Non-Voting Member	Main Roads WA Representative
Chris Sharples	Non-Voting Member	Wheatbelt Development Corporation Representative
Mandy Walker	Non-Voting Member	Regional Development Australia Wheatbelt – Representative
Ian Duncan	Non-Voting Member	WALGA Representative

1.2 Apologies

Cr Des Hickey	Voting Member	SRRG – Roe
Cr Grant Robins	Voting Member	SRRG – Lakes
Cr William Mulroney	Voting Member	SRRG – Hotham Dale
Cr Graham Broad	Voting Member	SRRG - Narrogin

1.3 Observers / Visitors

Nil

2.0 DECLARATIONS OF INTERESTS (Financial / Impartiality / Proximity)

Nil

3.0 CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES OF MEETING

RESOLUTION SC2023/10-025

That the Minutes of the Steering Committee meeting held on 01 September 2023 be confirmed as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

MOVED: Cr Rosemary Madacsi
SECONDED: Cr Eileen O’Connell
CARRIED: 5/0

4.0 FLYING MINUTE

Item 4	Shire of Merredin – Program Gap
Date of Report	28 September 2023
Author	Mr Peter Hall – Program Manager
Attachments	Email from the Shire of Merredin
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

The Steering Committee meeting on 01 September 2023 approved the reconciliation of the Shire of Merredin program, which allowed for various projects being rescheduled with no impact on the WSFN with regards to budget per project.

Merredin had scheduled works to commence on the 2022/2023 projects for September 2023, (funding was approved for these projects in 2022). The Steering Committee decision had an impact on these works in that extra sections were added to tie in like works in the same area. This request was put in place prior to the commencement of the new EMES Amer Tawfik.

Consultation:

The WSFN and Merredin met on the 11 September 2023 to bring Amer Tawfik up to speed and ensure that the WSFN funding and the program adjustments proposed were understood.

During this meeting, a 300m gap in the start finish slk ranges was discovered, a site inspection concluded that the section requires some work.

WSFN requested that Merredin confirm costs to include this section in the current program.

Proposal:

Merredin propose to treat the 300m with the same treatment as the section 7.94 to 8.4 at the same km rate with a value of \$90,000.

It is proposed to extend the finish slk to 8.7 and increase the budget by \$90,000 of the above section.

Financial Implications:

An increase of \$90,000 from the surplus.

Risk Assessment:

The section is showing the same signs of distress that is evident in the section previous, to leave the 300m off the programme will mean that it will continue to fail, and it might fail faster because of the new stronger pavement either side of it.

Comment:

Potentially, a typo occurred when the program was originated and was not picked up in subsequent assessments.

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-026**

That the Steering Committee **approves** the extension of the section from 7.94 to 8.4 out the extra 300m to 8.7 on the Merredin Naremben Road and increase the budget from \$133,173 to \$223,173.

MOVED: **Cr Rosemary Madacsi**
SECONDED **Cr Darrel Hudson**
CARRIED: **5/0**

5.0 SHIRE OF DUMBLEYUNG RESEAL REQUEST

Item 5	Shire of Dumbleyung Reseal Request
Date of Report	09 October 2023
Author	Mr Peter Hall – Program Manager
Attachments	a) 2021/22 – Kulin Dumbleyung Road Budget costing SLK0-4 b) 2022/23 – Kulin Dumbleyung Road Budget costing SLK4-8 c) S45R Reseal Quote Summary Kulin Dumbleyung Road SLK 0-8 (Bitutek, Colas and Fulton Hogan) d) Quote from Bitutek Pty Ltd e) Project Cost Variation Sheets (SLK 4-9 and SLK 0-4)
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

The Shire of Dumbleyung has had ongoing works delivering multiple WSNF projects from previous financial years, the work is progressing, and Dumbleyung is catching up the backlog. The works have continued into the colder months and to control seal issues, Dumbleyung opted to go with a Double/Double Emulsion 14/7 these have not been completely successful, and Dumbleyung is looking at a reseal with S45R as a topcoat.

Dumbleyung has some funds remaining in the budget so is not requesting all the extra costs required to add the additional seal coat.

Consultation:

The Shire of Dumbleyung have obtained quotes from Colas and Bitutek Pty Ltd (quote summary is attached).

Proposal:

Dumbleyung is requesting to add S45R to both sections 0 to 4 and 4 to 8 on the Rabbit Proof Fence Road. The cost for each section is \$209,928 with savings each section will need an additional:

- 0 to 4 = \$81,795
- 4 to 8 = \$180,649

Financial Implications:

\$262,444 to come from the surplus funds.

Risk Assessment:

An emulsion seal is good for low temperatures but should only be considered as a holding seal because of the short life span.

Comment:

Given the efforts made by the Shire of Dumbleyung over recent months and the need to ensure the required standards and quality is met in the finished product, it is recommended that the Committee approved the request.

The matter was considered by the Technical Committee on 13 October 2023 and the following recommendations were made:

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-027**

That the Steering Committee **approve** the Shire of Dumbleyung's request to reseal 8km of the Rabbit Proof Fence Road at a total cost of \$262,444 being split between the two projects 0 to 4 at \$81,795 and 4 to 8 \$180,649.

MOVED: **Cr Eileen O'Connell**
SECONDED: **Cr Rosemary Madacsi**
CARRIED: **5/0**

6.0 SHIRE OF WONGAN-BALLIDU 2023/2024 PROJECT

Item 6	Shire of Wongan-Ballidu 2023/2024 Project
Date of Report	09 October 2023
Author	Mr Peter Hall – Program Manager
Attachments	a) Letter requesting Variation, b) Project Scope Identification Form, c) WSFN Finalised budget schedule dated 14/09/23, d) WSFN Finalised Budget Summary dated 14/09/23, e) LG 21-067 – Particle Size Distribution (PSD) f) LG 21-068 – Particle Size Distribution (PSD) g) All other supporting documents (plan view, cross sections etc)
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

The Shire of Wongan-Ballidu (Wongan) completed 14 km of the Dowerin-Kalannie Road in the 2022 2023 financial year. The project did not have enough development and the determined methodology was based on previous shire works. In addition, Wongan found that the total length was too big for them to manage, and it had a negative impact on their remaining works for the RRG etc.

To meet their targets, Wongan had to rush and probably took some short cuts which has left them with an ongoing maintenance impost.

The WSFN requested a full review of the forward program by Wongan starting at the current year, the outcome was that a reduction in the future project lengths was strongly encouraged by the WSFN and as part of the review a quick assessment of the pavement by a pavement engineer was also encouraged.

Wongan has a project for this year on the Dowerin-Kalannie Road from 14 to 27 slk, a length of 13km at a budget of \$1,938,779. The final project cost was \$2,247,432 a cost per km of \$160,531.

Subgrade has been tested and found to be more than adequate. Siva Thillainath has determined that box out widening to 11m, import material to existing level, stabilise and shape the existing, then import 200mm and wet mix will meet the WSFN requirements.

Wongan has re-costed the 2023-2024 project with the new scope and process. These are provided in the attached summary sheets.

Consultation:

Stabiltech was engaged to give advice and testing.

Proposal:

Wongan requests to change the scope to 5km from 14 to 19slk at a budget of \$1,910,657. Cost per km of \$382,131.

Financial Implications:

There is no increase in the budget required, however there is less road being delivered, the offset is that the quality will be at WSFN standards.

Risk Assessment:

The risk is the pavement will fail prematurely.

Comment:

WSFN motto is *“Build to a standard, not to a cost.”* A lack of pre-testing and trying to deliver too much has put pressure on the Shire that it could not handle.

The matter was considered by the Technical Committee on 13 October 2023 and the following recommendations were made:

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-028**

That the Steering Committee **approve** the scope change for Wongan Ballidu to 5 km from 14 to 19 slk at a budget of \$1,910,657 on the Dowerin-Kalannie Road.

MOVED: Cr Trevor Stacey
SECONDED: Cr Darrel Hudson
CARRIED: 5/0

7.0 S45R BITUMEN BINDER

Item 7	S45R Bitumen Binder
Date of Report	09 October 2023
Author	Mr Peter Halll – Program Manager
Attachments	Nil
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

WSFN is fielding requests to adopt an S45R binder and other rubber percentage binders as part of the sealing specifications. There is a ground swell of support for utilising S45R due to the problems encountered with C170 binder. The problems being experienced are:

- Some of the results for testing of C170 are falling outside of the tolerances due to the petroleum industry trying to maximise fuel production for the world.
- The window for the perfect application rate is now so small that it is very hard to achieve and spray companies are erring on the side of caution meaning that a lower app rate is delivered, this has flow on consequences.
- Lower app rates mean less life span before a reseal is required.
- Bleeding occurs when the binder is too high on the stone, previously if a seal had gone through a summer with no problems, then it was considered good, this is no longer the case; seals are now bleeding two or three years after application.

Consultation:

Benefits of S45R

- Includes crumbed rubber in the mix giving eco points.
- Resists stripping,
- Does not bleed,
- Has longer life before resealing required 20+ years,
- Can be sprayed double/double,
- Is used as a Strain Alleviating Membrane (SAM) to resist cracking etc.

Detriments

- Cannot be sprayed in small quantities – smallest batch size is 20,000l, however as the industry adopts S45R then this will become less of a problem.
- More expensive than C170
- Less forgiving during application - C170 is becoming more sensitive to errors so this problem is having less and less impact.
 - Primer seal application not advised, an eco-prime or emulsion prime with no volatiles is strongly recommended instead.
 - Surface and stone needs to be clean.
 - Spray temperature both surface and product are critical.

Proposal:

That the WSNF adopts S45R or crumbed rubber binders as the final seal layer as a minimum and encourages the use of S45R for all reseal applications, seals on base course must have an appropriate prime.

Financial Implications:

Initial cost of S45R is approx. 15% higher than C170, however the whole of life cost savings experienced by the shires far exceeds this.

Rubber is sourced from old tyres so aids in a world rubbish problem gaining eco points.

Risk Assessment:

Main Roads WA are beginning to adopt crumbed rubber seals as a business-as-usual protocol. This is because of the problems of stripping and bleeding being experienced by the current C170 seals. Main Roads have far greater traffic counts than the local governments however, the Shires do not have the funds to indulge in an optimal reseal program.

Comment:

Given all the positive benefits outlined, the PMT recommend that the use of S45R be adopted as per the recommendation below.

The matter was considered by the Technical Committee on 13 October 2023 and the following recommendations were made:

Officer Recommendation

That the Technical Committee recommends to the Steering Committee to adopt the S45R and other crumbed rubber binder options as the final seal layer as a minimum and encourages the use of S45R for all reseal applications. Seals on base course must have an appropriate prime and that the adoption is added to the Basis of Design.

The matter was considered by the Technical Committee on 13 October 2023 and the following recommendations were made:

Technical Committee Recommendation:

- S45R and other crumbed rubber binder as an option for the final seal layer
- Encourage the use of S45R for all reseal applications.
- S45R seals on base course must have an appropriate prime and that the adoption is added to the Basis of Design.

After discussions, the Steering Committee adopted and voted on the following:

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-029**

- S45R and other crumbed rubber binder as an option for the final seal layer
- Encourage the use of S45R for all reseal applications.
- S45R seals on base course must have an appropriate prime and that the adoption is added to the Basis of Design.
- All applications of S45R and other crumb rubber binders to comply with Main Roads SPECIFICATION 509: POLYMER MODIFIED BITUMINOUS SURFACING.
- A "subject matter expert" report be provided to the Technical Committee from the first project using this treatment to evaluate and consider any changes to the seal treatments for the WSN.

MOVED: **Cr Rosemary Madacsi**
SECONDED: **Cr Eileen O'Connell**
CARRIED: **5/0**

Mandy Walker – Non-Voting Member from the Regional Development Australia Wheatbelt Representative joined the TEAMS meeting at 10:34am.

8.0 SHIRE OF CUBALLING – REQUEST FOR BUDGET INCREASE

Item 8	Shire of Cuballing – Request for Budget Increase
Date of Report	16 October 2023
Author	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director
Attachments	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Letter from the CEO – Shire of Cuballing – 2022/2023 Variation Claim• Shire of Cuballing – Project Cost Variation Sheet (Cuballing East Road)
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

The Shire of Cuballing undertook WSNF works on the Cuballing East Road (SLK 2.42 to 7.13) in the 2022/23 Financial Year. The budget for these works was presented to the Steering Committee for a variation at the meeting held in November 2022. At that time, the revised budget provided to the Shire was \$1,688,396.

During the course of the works, there was some communication with the PMT regarding additional expenditure (mainly relating to additional machinery and material), but no definite idea of the total expenditure was provided.

At the end of the project, the Shire calculated the total expenditure and found they had significantly over expended. They have been working with the PMT since that time to determine exactly what and why that over expenditure occurred and to put in place systems to prevent it from occurring again in the future.

The Shire have provided a spreadsheet (copy attached) showing the original budget and the actual expenditure with explanations provided for over budget amounts. Additionally, following meetings between the PMT and the Shire a letter providing explanations (including positive changes made to prevent a repeat in the future) is attached.

This item seeks approval from the Steering Committee to allow the over expenditure to be paid by the WSNF fund.

Consultation:

There have been significant discussions, including an in person meeting with staff from the Shire of Cuballing.

Proposal:

That the WSNF fund increases the budget for the Shire of Cuballing project Cuballing East Road 2.42 to 7.13 to \$1,759,902.

Financial Implications:

A cost to the WSNF fund that was not anticipated.

Risk Assessment:

Should the application not be granted, the Shire of Cuballing will have to carry the over expenditure.

Comment:

The WSFN works has proved to be a steep learning curve for the Shire of Cuballing. They have recognised (albeit slightly late) the need to keep a very close eye on expenditure during the course of the project. From the correspondence provided, the Steering Committee should have some confidence that those lessons have been learned and new systems and procedures introduced within the Shire to improve both WSFN and non WSFN projects in the future.

On the basis of these learnings being implemented and the commitment to regular sharing of information in future projects, the PMT are recommending that the Steering Committee agree to increasing the budget for the project as outlined.

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-030**

That the Steering Committee **approve** an increase in the budget for the Shire of Cuballing project Cuballing East Road SLK 2.42 to 7.13 to a total budget of \$1,759,902.

MOVED: **Cr Rosemary Madacsi**
SECONDED: **CR Eileen O'Connell**
CARRIED: **5/0**

9.0 SHIRE OF MERREDIN CULVERT 9.18 – MERREDIN-NAREMBEEN ROAD

Item 9	Shire of Merredin Culvert 9.18 Merredin Narembeen Rd
Date of Report	19 October 2023
Author	Mr Peter Hall – Program Manager
Attachments	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Email from the Shire of Merredin• Two (2) quotes received for the works
Senior Officer	Mr John Nuttall – Program Director

Background:

The Shire of Merredin (Merredin) had to add upgrades of two major culverts on the Merredin Narembeen Road when it was discovered during development that the surface width was narrower than the proposed new seal width. Both culvert additions were costed and then market tested with a quote for the first culvert and then they were approved by the Technical and Steering Committees. The culverts are too large to be delivered in house as Merredin does not have the equipment so must be delivered via contract. One culvert was delivered last year on budget. When going to market this year for the second culvert the two quotes come back over budget.

Consultation:

Merredin went to market via WALGA open tender system and received two quotes:

- Sims Civil - \$250,987
- Ringa Civil – 281,500

Unfortunately, Merredin discovered that Sims Civil is not in the WALGA preferred supplier list and despite their best efforts neither Merredin nor Sims have been able to fix this.

Proposal:

Merredin are requesting an additional \$160,166 funds to deliver the culvert this year and extra sealing works fencing etc.

This will bring to project value to \$300,000.

Financial Implications:

The extra funds will be covered by the program surplus.

Risk Assessment:

The need to widen this culvert is still present as it will leave a bottleneck and the structure will not meet Australian Standards.

Comment:

Merredin did not test the market after their estimate for this culvert. Merredin first costed this culvert at \$248,600 but reduced the estimate based on the first culverts quote and at the review request of the WSFN PM, who felt that the estimate was too high.

RESOLUTION **SC2023/10-031**

That the Steering Committee **approved** the budget increase for the Culvert at 9.18 SLK on the Merredin Narembeen Road up to a value of \$300,000.

MOVED: Cr Eileen O’Connell
SECONDED: Cr Rosemary Madacsi
CARRIED: 5/0

10.0 CLOSURE

The Chairperson announced that the next Steering Committee meeting will be determined at a later date after the local government elections and member shires have nominated their representatives to the Regional Road Group.

There being no further business to discuss, the Chairperson closed the meeting at 11:25am.